

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
A. ISRP	ISRP-35	ISRP Report, p. 98 (p. 93 in the printed version of the report)	Population assessment	The Panel's review identified the following general areas of future research: Annual monitoring of gray whale foraging and habitat use patterns, including prey, habitats and variability in foraging patterns over space and time – the resultant time series of data may identify changes in habitat correlated with certain development activities.		Sakhalin Energy is currently undertaking this work and is planning to continue this in future years.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 1, p.3 (of IISG report)		Photo ID	Continuation of the Russia-US Photo-ID research programme.	Sakhalin Energy	This is an independent programme, which is externally funded and does not require an action from Sakhalin Energy.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
D. GWGAP 1	WGWAP 1/002	WGWAP 1/3 Section 4.2	Population assessment	The Panel recommends that from this year onwards, certain simple statistics from photo-identification studies be reported by Sakhalin Energy as routine information after each field season, including: field effort, number of different whales sighted and identified, number of identified females and males sighted, number of calves, number of 'new' whales, number of mother-calf pairs, number of skinny whales, and any known deaths. The Panel also looks forward to receiving the detailed analysis of the 'skinny' whale issue being undertaken by the Russia-USA team.	Sakhalin Energy	Such statistics have been provided every year in MNR report. 2006 statistics will be a part of the report due by Mar 31 2007.	31.03.07	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. GWGAP 3	WGWAP 3/007	WGWAP 3/3 Section 5.1	Population assessment	The Panel recommends that steps be taken to facilitate use of the combined data in a population assessment.	Photo-ID Task Force			Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. GWGAP 3	WGWAP 3/033	WGWAP 3/3 Section 8.1	Photo ID	The Panel endorses the findings and recommendations of the Task Force and requests that Sakhalin Energy, the two photo-ID research teams, and other relevant parties implement the recommendations as expeditiously as possible.	Sakhalin Energy and others			Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. GWGAP 3	WGWAP 3/034	WGWAP 3/3 Section 8.9	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that the Task Force should continue its work according to the revised terms of reference.	Photo-ID Task Force			Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
I. WGAP 5	WGAP 5/003	Section 6.4	Photo ID	The Panel reiterates the great importance it attaches to the work of this Task Force. It sees the timely co-operation of Sakhalin Energy in this work as symbolic of Sakhalin Energy's commitment or otherwise to the Panel process. Without effective participation from Sakhalin Energy, the Task Force will fail.	Sakhalin Energy	The target dates for the completion on the task force recommendations have been agreed and will be met.	None specified	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/015	Item 7.1	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that the cross-matching of the catalogues be updated annually.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy Agrees to this and recommends that 2008 catalogues be compared in December 2009.	June, annually	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/017	Item 7.1	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that the Task Force be continued, with the reduced list of remaining tasks identified in the pre-meeting workshop report, and that it should try to meet again in-person, preferably immediately prior to WGAP-7.	Sakhalin Energy, WGAP	Sakhalin Energy supports this.	December 2009	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/018	Item 7.1	Photo ID	The Panel requests that the membership of the Task Force be specified soon after WGAP-6.	Sakhalin Energy, WGAP	Sakhalin Energy supports this.	Jun-09	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/020	Item 7.2	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that data sets be assigned version numbers, and that a record of all retrospective changes to data be maintained.	Various	Sakhalin Energy will confirm in December how the Company will do this.	December 2009	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/016	Item 7.1	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that a population analysis based on the combined photo-ID data sets data should be conducted in time for WGAP-7.	WGAP Cooke		December 2009	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
K. WGAP-7	WGAP-7/014	Item 6.2	Photo ID	The meeting thanked the two teams for their work, and agreed that the cross-matching should continue annually as long as each team is collecting data.	Sakhalin Energy / Russia-US team	Sakhalin Energy will participate in the cross matching of catalogues provided there remains value in this exercise.	Annually	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/033	6.1	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that the annual cross-matching exercise be continued as long as both teams are operating.	Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team	SEIC agrees with continuation of this exercise and seeks the WGWAP support in making this happen.	Statements of intent and schedule to be agreed at WGWAP-10	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 3, p.5 (of IISG report)		Photo ID	Integration of photographs and data of both the Russia-US and IBM Photo-ID research programs, after they have passed through appropriate quality control procedures. This would enable more precise estimation of the population developments and might decrease any duplication of field efforts that potentially exposes the whales to unnecessary disturbance from research.	All research groups	Sakhalin Energy agrees this initiative could provide more information on the western gray whale population status. Approval from all parties involved is needed to further this effort. ACTION: Sakhalin Energy will contact key parties to take this forward.	Jun-06	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	Superseded by Photo-ID Task Force.	
G. WGWAP 3	WGWAP 3/008	WGWAP 3/3 Section 5.3	Population assessment	The Panel recommends that a preliminary analysis be carried out on the possible effects of disturbance on reproductive success or other aspects of demography.	Panel			Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	Superseded by Photo-ID Task Force.	
G. WGWAP 3	WGWAP 3/009	WGWAP 3/3 Section 5.3	Population assessment	The Panel recommends , as suggested by the Photo-ID Task Force, that data on body condition be incorporated into a population assessment if possible.	Panel			Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	Superseded by Photo-ID Task Force.	
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/034	6.2	Photo ID	On behalf of the IWC, Donovan granted permission for the two photo-ID teams to match the whales identified during the tagging effort with their catalogues, although publication priority will be given to those who collected the data. The Panel recommends that the two teams include matches with the tagging photo-ID results in their reports of data collected in 2010.	Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team	Due to the large numbers of photographs taken by the tagging team, there is insufficient time to process this data set prior to preparing the annual report. Instead we propose to include the tagging results in the annual US-Russian / SEIC catalogue crossmatching to determine the total number of whales observed in 2010.	WGWAP-10	Open - in progress		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/035	6.3	Photo ID	The Panel emphasises the crucial role played by the Russia-US team's data in estimating trends in the population.... The Panel strongly urges that a means be found to continue the Russia-US photo-ID programme, which has been running for 15 years.	NGOs and others		Before June 2011	Open - in progress		
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/037	6.3	Photo ID	To facilitate this [biopsy sampling of calves of the year], the Panel requests that the relevant Federal and Oblast authorities view permit applications to collect biopsies from the calves of the year favourably.	Russian Federal and Oblast authorities		Not relevant	Open - no action yet taken		
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/038	7	Population assessment	The Panel drew attention to a recent paper (Bradford et al. 2011) that explains how calves can be distinguished visually from older animals with high confidence, based on examination of barnacle and pigmentation characteristics in the head region. The Panel recommends that this approach be used by the IBM team.	Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team	Sakhalin Energy and Olga Tyurneva will review this paper and if deemed useful it might be included in the calf scoring system, which was designed in 2009 jointly with Vicky Rowntree.	Statement of intent at WGWAP-10	Open - no action yet taken		
M. WGWAP-9	WGWAP-9/039	7	Population assessment	Every effort will be made to ensure that the review [of the Cooke model] is completed by WGWAP-10. If the outcome of the review is favourable, a version of the analysis can be submitted for publication in a peer-reviewed journal. The Panel recommends that it also be submitted to the May-June 2011 IWC Scientific Committee meeting.	IUCN and Panel (Cooke)		May-11	Open - no action yet taken		
I. WGWAP 5	WGWAP 5/009	Section 15	Photo ID	In addition to the outstanding tasks of the Photo-ID Task Force, the Panel recommends that Gailey carry out an analysis that compares the disturbance caused by boats of the IBM photo-ID team vs. the boat of the Russia-US team.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy is cognisant of the potential impact of zodiacs approaching whales to take photographs. However Sakhalin Energy believes that it is better to direct our effort to training our boating crews to minimize disturbance as opposed to carry out an analysis that is likely to be inconclusive and does not address the root cause.	End of March 2009	Rejected by Sakhalin Energy		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/019	Item 7.2	Photo ID	In view of the problems found by the Photo-ID Task Force with identifications of some mother-calf pairs, the Panel recommends that the Task Force examine photos of this calf carefully to verify its status.	Photo-ID TF	The IBM calf determination scoring system was applied to the Kamchatka calf. As a result of this exercise, the whale was assigned a "high" (Class B) certainty of being a calf. The calf (and its mother) was observed only once, but had the mother-calf pair been seen on multiple occasions, the calf certainty score would have been "very high" (Class A). The calf's mother is a known reproductive female from Sakhalin, but in the previous year (2007) was sighted only in Kamchatka (without a calf). Sakhalin Energy is confident in this determination and does not believe additional work on this would change the status of this calf.	Prior to December 2009	Rejected by Sakhalin Energy		
M. WGAP-9	WGAP-9/036	6.3	Photo ID	The Panel recommends that every effort be made to ensure that biopsies are obtained each year from the calves of the year.	Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team	Sakhalin Energy/ENL has submitted the 2011 joint program to MNR for approval, it does not include taking biopsies of calves. Neither Company foresee doing this in the proximate future as there is a programme from which it is believed adequate data has been collected but not shared.	Statements of intent/ feasibility at WGAP-10	Rejected by Sakhalin Energy		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/006	Item 3	Photo ID	This exercise [of ranking whales as candidates for tagging] would have benefited from incorporation of the IBM photo-identification data, with an ultimate objective to plot precisely on a map where males have been located in the feeding areas. The Panel endorsed this line of thought and recommends that such a joint analysis be undertaken.	Sakhalin Energy, WGAP	Sakhalin Energy agrees that this would be a valuable exercise. The 2008 data should be considered at a Photo ID TF meeting in December 2009 and the plot updated with 2009 data in April 2010.	December 2009	Retracted by WGAP		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
M. WGAP-10	WGAP-10/003	Item 3.2	Photo ID	<p>The Panel considers that the comparison of the two teams' matching of the tagging and pre-tagging photos with their respective catalogues will be undertaken most efficiently if combined with the regular annual update of cross-matching of the 2010 catalogues. However, whales identified during the tagging or pre-tagging fieldwork should be clearly indicated as such. Accordingly, the Panel recommends that each team: (i) include whales identified during the tagging and pre-tagging work in the 2010 update of its Sakhalin catalogue; (ii) upon submitting its updated catalogue, indicate which whales were identified in the tagging and pre-tagging work. Here the teams should distinguish between: (a) whales identified only during the tagging or pre-tagging work and (b) whales identified both during tagging or pre-tagging work and during other surveys. The Panel further recommends the following timetable: IUCN (Bernal) sends a request to the two teams on 15 July 2011, asking them to submit their Sakhalin catalogues (based on data collected through 2010, and including data from the 2010 tagging/pre-tagging surveys) to IUCN by 1 September, following the previously established schedule. IUCN then forwards the catalogues to each team, with a request for results of cross-matching to be returned by 1 January 2012.</p>	Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team, IUCN	Sakhalin Energy supports this recommendation. (i) Photos for 2010 have been shared. (ii) And, will be included for comparison, but not entered in the SEIC catalogue. Note: It is SEIC's understanding that data collected during 2011 tagging programme will be shared openly.	Between 15 July 2011 and 1 January 2012	Open - in progress		
M. WGAP-10	WGAP-10/004	Item 3.3.1	Photo ID	<p>The Panel recommends that permission from the respective data owners (Burdin, Vertyankin) and co-owners (Sakhalin Energy and ENL in the case of the Kamchatka catalogue) be sought by IUCN (or by Sakhalin Energy on IUCN's behalf) and that an exchange and cross-matching between the Russia-US and Kamchatka catalogues be organised on the same basis as the arrangements used to date for comparisons of the two Sakhalin catalogues, depending on the time taken to receive the required permissions. The Panel requests that IUCN (Bernal) take the lead on this.</p>	IUCN, Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team, ENL	SEIC will endeavour, through discussions with IBM and ENL, to support IUCN with this recommendation.	WGAP-11	Open - no action yet taken		

GWAP Recommendations Table - Photo ID and Population assessment

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
M. GWAP-10	GWAP-10/005	Item 3.3.2	Photo ID	The Panel was pleased to learn the results of this comparison [between western and eastern North Pacific catalogues] and recommends that additional matching to other existing catalogues be undertaken. Some individuals in the IBM catalogue have not been found in the Russia-US programme's catalogue. The Panel therefore encourages inclusion of these IBM whales in the present comparison with the ENP catalogue.	Sakhalin Energy, IUCN, Panel	SEIC understands that the data owners of the IBM catalogue are committed to conduct this analysis, and they will look into organizing this comparison. SEIC have had discussions with Russia-US team (Dave Weller) on this item - a proposal is in draft. Comparisons with the American & Mexican catalogues would be advantageous.	GWAP-11	Open - in progress		
M. GWAP-10	GWAP-10/006	Item 3.3.2	Photo ID	Tsidulko drew attention to a potentially large set of photographs collected by Vladimir Burkanov of gray whales along the north-eastern Kamchatka and eastern Karyakia coasts and the Panel encourages that Burkanov be approached and invited to contribute his data and photographs to the comparison exercises.	IUCN, Panel		GWAP-11	Open - no action yet taken		
M. GWAP-10	GWAP-10/007	Item 5.1	Population assessment	The Panel requests that Cooke prepare a written response to the reviewers' comments before GWAP-11.	Panel (Cooke)		Before GWAP-11	Open - no action yet taken		
M. GWAP-10	GWAP-10/008	Item 5.1	Population assessment	The Panel recommends that the [joint population] assessment be submitted for publication with the authorship that had been agreed between the two teams, and that it include data through the 2009 season (the version that was reviewed included data through 2008).	Panel (Cooke), Sakhalin Energy, Russia-US team	Sakhalin Energy supports this recommendation.	As soon as feasible	Open - no action yet taken		