

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
A. ISRP	ISRP-16	ISRP Report, p. 43 (p. 40 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	The zones of sensitivity outlined in the Marine Mammal Protection Plan are mentioned but not defined in the CEA (Section 6.2.2), so the status of this proposed mitigation measure is uncertain.		At the time of the CEA the development of these mitigation measures was discussed with all parties involved and was work in progress.	Mar-05	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
A. ISRP	ISRP-18	ISRP Report, p. 44 (p. 41 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	Sakhalin Energy proposes to limit vessel speeds in the nearshore and offshore feeding grounds to 5 knots at night and during periods of reduced visibility, and to 7 knots during daylight with good visibility conditions. However, it is not clear how visibility is to be judged.		This comment has been taken into consideration and will be updated in 2005 Marine Mammal Protection Plan.	Apr-05	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
A. ISRP	ISRP-14	ISRP Report, p. 45 (p. 41 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	A possible means to minimise risk of collisions for ships departing Prigorodnoye would be to route them immediately offshore from the southwestern tip of Sakhalin and then plot the lane through La Perouse Strait equidistant from each coast to minimise the amount of time spent transiting close to shore. While this route may add a small amount of time to the total transit, it could be applied only seasonally when the whales migrate through the area.		The issue is with increased ship traffic in La Perouse Strait during WGW spring and autumn migration is recognised by Sakhalin Energy.	Mar-05	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 30, p.14 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	IISG emphasizes that downward adjustment of speed limits as a precaution in the portions of the navigation corridors approaching the PA-A and PA-B platforms deserves further consideration by Sakhalin Energy management. We further note that the available (albeit inconclusive) evidence on ship strikes on large whales suggests that fatal strikes are less likely to occur when vessels are travelling at speeds less than 14 knots.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy has made the commitment to reduce vessel speed limits to 10 knots during the day and 7 knots at low visibility and at night in the section of the navigational corridors that approach PA-A and PA-B platforms. This requirement is updated in the Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2006.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
C. IISG	Item 31, p.14 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Sakhalin Energy to reconsider the adequacy of having a single MMO responsible for maintaining continuous watch during the entire roundtrip of the crew boat to the Molikpaq; there is a clear need for at least two MMOs to ensure consistently adequate vigilance.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy has committed to increase the number of MMOs from one to two on the crew change vessels that run from Kaigon to the platforms in the Piltun area. This requirement is updated in the Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2006.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 34, p.15-16 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Steps to assess the efficacy and to improve the marine mammal observer program where necessary could include: (2) Implementation of procedures to check the MMO data for mistakes, make corrections, and ensure that observers are fully informed of correct data collection procedures.	Sakhalin Energy	A Microsoft Access database is used to minimize mistakes while entering the data. Sakhalin Energy is currently in the process of hiring an MMO to be based in Yuzhno to focus on QAQC and the compilation of MMO data from the vessels on a daily basis. This person will thereby receive an overview of all marine mammal sightings and will be requested to provide feedback to the MMOs in the field with regard to WGW sightings within the project area (This is additional to the exchange of info between MMOs in the field).		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 35, p.16 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Steps to assess the efficacy and to improve the marine mammal observer program where necessary could include: (3) Broad assessment of MMO operations to ensure that the program is functioning as expected.	Sakhalin Energy	The examples mentioned in the IISG report are part of the MMO Manual and are implemented by the dedicated MMO-coordinator. There is extensive communication between the Sakhalin Energy MMO coordinator and MMOs on vessels. Prior to mobilisation, the MMO and the Sakhalin Energy representative onboard receive a briefing on marine mammal issues, mitigation measures and communication protocols.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 36, p.16 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	All recommendations or instructions to the Sakhalin Energy officer onboard and the captain should be documented to provide information to assess their compliance with protection measures. The command structure should be clarified and included as part of the training for observers, onboard Sakhalin Energy officers, and for vessel captains involved in Sakhalin Energy operations.	Sakhalin Energy	In all instances where marine mammals are being observed, the MMO reports on daily reporting sheets whether mitigation measures were considered necessary. In instances where no mitigation measures were taken and yet the distance to the vessel was less than the safety distance, the rationale behind the decision must be noted. The command structure is set out in the MMO Manual and is communicated to all parties involved.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
C. IISG	Item 37, p.16 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Observations of gray whales from vessels involved in Sakhalin Energy operations should be communicated to all other vessels in the area to ensure they are alerted to the presence of the whales. This should be done routinely, but is especially important when visibility is reduced.	Sakhalin Energy	Agree. This is part of the existing protocol and the importance of WGW sightings is repeated during training and prior to mobilisation both to the MMO and Sakhalin Energy vessel representative.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
C. IISG	Item 38, p.16 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	It is recommended that daylight observer coverage be continuous during activities associated with construction of the pipelines from offshore to onshore south of the feeding ground.	Sakhalin Energy	Agree. MMOs stationed on vessels involved in offshore pipeline construction and other construction activities observe continuously during daylight conditions.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 10.2		Traffic & MMO	The principal focus for avoiding collisions should be on spatial separation (e.g. use of vessel lanes). Greater specificity is required for vessel routes and speed restrictions (including criteria for "low visibility"), including the area between the feeding grounds during the construction period and tanker routes from Aniva Bay during operation. Sakhalin Energy should not rely solely on onboard observers due to observation limits (e.g. can only see animals at the surface, visibility impaired by fog, rough seas, low light). Expert response to Sakhalin Energy Issue Table and Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2005 included concerns over: - proposed vessel speed limits; - procedures when travelling parallel to WGW; - corridors for vessels leaving Aniva Bay; - definition of protection and feeding zones; - protection of transit routes between feeding grounds; and - enforcement (see also issue above). Participants at Gland discussed the possibility and importance of working with other operators in the region on this issue.	Sakhalin Energy	Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2005 defines the Chaivo and Piltun feeding grounds as protection zones (8, 29b) and includes a statement of all mitigation measures to be used. WGW migration routes are not sufficiently understood to define (see also oversight issue below) however the offshore navigational corridors were selected to avoid the nearshore zone that migrating whales are expected to be using; higher speed limits are used in the navigational corridors as gray whales are expected to be absent from those areas (30). Vessel navigation and construction corridors are defined between the LNG/OET site, the 3 offshore platforms and along the offshore pipeline route (Alternative 1). The MMPP 2005 defines speed limits as follows: Visibility >1km: 17kts (navigational corridors), 10kts (construction corridors), 7kts (feeding areas) Visibility <1km/nighttime: 17kts (navigational corridors), 7kts (construction corridors), 5kts (feeding areas). All vessels are tracked using the Vessel Tracking System (27, 32) that allows real time position and speed to be audited. Few vessels used by Sakhalin Energy will be travelling at above 15 knots. The average speed of vessels (based on their economical speed) is 11.5 knots (34). (REFS: 8, 27, 29b, 30, 32, 34). Further expert opinion/discussion required - including sharing of Marine Mammal Observer data collected to date. Sakhalin Energy accepts to review these concerns in consultation with the WGAP.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 10.4		Traffic & MMO	Sighting information services for vessels is recommended.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy is currently using an online Vessel Tracking System (27, 32) that allows position tracking of vessels by satellite (8). (REFS: 8, 27, 32)		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 7.1		Traffic & MMO	Observer programmes require independent oversight or verification of compliance to ensure their effectiveness. See also Issue 18.1 details. Independent monitoring is required. This might be addressed by the advisory body (issue 18.1).	Sakhalin Energy	Development of Terms of Reference for an advisory body are underway with an IUCN committee. Until such time as that body is established, Sakhalin Energy, on an annual basis, will work with the IUCN to develop an annual workshop that will invite representatives from all of the WGW range states. The first meeting of this workshop will be in March 2006. An independent external audit (28) of the Marine Mammal Observers programme was undertaken in June 2005 and a report issued in July. Sakhalin Energy has responded to the recommendations made in that audit (REFS: 28, 30). Awaiting Terms of Reference for advisory body function for discussion. Sakhalin Energy has implemented recommendations that arose out of the Marine Mammal Observers Audit. Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGAP.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 9.1		Traffic & MMO	Collisions of whales with vessels may cause injury and mortality and are an issue of concern. A quantitative assessment is needed to better characterize this risk and identify sources of risk that can be reduced by mitigation measures. The assessment must include an evaluation of the expected effectiveness of the mitigation measures. The assessment should encompass construction and operation phases off northeastern Sakhalin as well as tanker vessel traffic leaving Prigorodnoye and in La Perouse Strait. This topic was addressed briefly at Gland and Vancouver??, where the need for and feasibility of such an assessment was discussed. Some experts raised the issue of how an ALARP determination can be made if no quantification of risks has been attempted (response to Sakhalin Energy Issues table and Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2005 prior to Gland).	Sakhalin Energy	The MMO Programme of Sakhalin Energy is based on the assumption that the collision risk is high, meaning that the effort is to minimize the risk is maximized. However, because a collision risk assessment is considered valuable Sakhalin Energy has commissioned a study to assess the collision risk to WGWs (34). A model has been built and will be run using a variety of different scenarios. The model has been developed with input /advice from experts. A report is due in August 2005. This issue will continue to be addressed through modifications, as needed, to the Marine Mammal Protection Plan (8). (REFS: 8, 34). Work is ongoing. This issue will be addressed, in part, through definition of vessel corridors, speed restrictions, marine mammal observers, operating restrictions, etc. in the Marine Mammal Protection Plan 2005 - see below (issue 10). Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGWAP.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/023 (b)	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	Concerning the issue of reducing collision risks associated with crew change vessels, the Panel notes some positive changes in the Sakhalin Energy approach. However, it believes that further work in this area is important and should be pursued. Therefore, it is recommend that: (b) Further measures be taken to avoid deviations of crew change vessels from the prescribed route;	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy has a procedure in place and follows up on all deviations.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/024	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	Taking into account previously raised concerns with regard to the effectiveness of the MMO programme, the Panel looks forward to reviewing details of the MMO training protocol to examine its effectiveness prior to the 2007 construction season.	Sakhalin Energy	MMO training programme will be presented	Feb-07	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/027	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.2	Traffic & MMO	Additionally, the Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy submit for review its protocol for allocating MMOs to the various vessels in the fleet.	Sakhalin Energy	There is no formal assignment protocol. Sakhalin Energy has a pool of trained MMO that are assigned to vessels as required.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/028	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.2	Traffic & MMO	Finally, the Panel recommends that Sakhalin Energy share its traffic rules, its scheme of vessel navigation corridors and its MMO programme plan with other oil and gas companies operating on the Sakhalin Shelf, regardless of whether those companies are obligated to implement such rules, protocols and programmes.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy encourages IUCN to provide this information to other operators with whom IUCN has contact. Sakhalin Energy has shared this with ENL.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
F. WGWAP-2	WGWAP 2/006	WGWAP 2/3 Section 6.1	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that as a matter of routine, IUCN and Sakhalin Energy ensure that the Panel is provided with relevant updated MMPP documents for review well in advance of each field season.	Sakhalin Energy	MMPP will be provided.	15-Jun-07	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
F. WGWAP-2	WGWAP 2/008	WGWAP 2/3 Section 6.2	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that no crew change vessel trips are conducted during the night (any instances where this policy is not followed should be documented with an explanation of the circumstances in the 2007 close-out report).	Sakhalin Energy	The main crew change platform will be helicopter, with the crew change boats being the back up option. Crew change trips will be conducted during daylight, unless night trips are absolutely necessary for safety or other operational reasons. These occasions will be documented and included in the MMO closeout report.	30-Nov-07	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
F. WGWAP-2	WGWAP 2/009	WGWAP 2/3 Section 6.3	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that the MMO dataset, in conjunction with the company's other records of vessel operations, be analysed by Sakhalin Energy, with a view to evaluating each of the factors (specified in the report text) that contributes to overall effective coverage.	Sakhalin Energy	In the 2006 MMO closeout report Sakhalin Energy already conducted some analysis regarding effective coverage. However, Sakhalin Energy will look into more detail to the factors specified in the current WGWAP report and may seek the panel's advice on a detailed protocol of such analysis.	30-Sep-07	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
G. WGAP-3	WGAP 3/002	WGAP 3/3 Section 3.2.3	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that from now on at least the following data be collected by the MMO Programme: time and position of each start or change of vessel activity (including those when no MMO is on watch); visibility (including time and position when it changes); start and end time and position of each MMO watch period; time and position of each whale sighting.	Sakhalin Energy	All the data listed are already part of the MMO protocol during daylight. In 2008 MMOs will be instructed to collect data on time and position of each change of vessel direction during nighttime. However, this requires that the records are available in the vessel's log book.	Jun-08	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. WGAP-3	WGAP 3/003	WGAP 3/3 Section 3.2.3	Traffic & MMO	The Panel requests that after each season, summaries of the MMO data be presented to the Panel that show: the number of trips by operating support vessels; the proportion of each trip that occurs in poor visibility (e.g., darkness, fog); the proportion of each trip that observers were on watch; hours of observation; numbers and locations of sighted whales.	Sakhalin Energy	To be presented at the Nov 2008 WGAP-5 or April 2009 WGAP-6.	Nov-08	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. WGAP-3	WGAP 3/005	WGAP 3/3 Section 3.3	Traffic & MMO	The skewed distribution of MMO sightings from crew change vessels – the vast majority came from one of the three vessels – raised concern on the part of the Panel and requires further investigation. The Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy analyzes this discrepancy and reports its findings at the next meeting.	Sakhalin Energy	An analysis will be presented at the next WGAP meeting and included in the 2007 MMO Close-out Report		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
G. WGAP-3	WGAP 3/006	WGAP 3/3 Section 3.3	Traffic & MMO	The Panel reiterates its previous recommendation that MMOs should be placed on the crew change vessel operating between Nogliki and LUN-A at all times.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy will endeavour to place MMOs on crew change vessel operating between Nogliki and LUN-A at all times. The only limitation is the accommodation on the vessels		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
H. WGAP-4	WGAP 4/001	WGAP 4/4 - Section 5.2	Traffic & MMO	The Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy provide clear explanations for Miss Sybil's inshore movements on 6 and 21 September, 1 and 13 October and 2, 3 and 5 November 2007.	Sakhalin Energy	Explanations will be provided to the Panel.	Aug-08	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
H. WGAP-4	WGAP-4/002	WGAP 4/4 - Section 5.2	Traffic & MMO	The Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy continue to document vessel deviations from the navigation corridors towards a WGW feeding area and make this information available in its annual MMO reports	Sakhalin Energy	Known vessel deviations from the navigation corridors towards a WGW feeding area are recorded and will be included in annual MMO reports.		Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
J. WGAP-6	WGAP-6/025	Item 12.1	Traffic & MMO	The Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy report back at WGAP-7 regarding the crew change vessel replacement process and any related efforts to improve collision avoidance procedures.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy will report back in December.	December 2009	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
L. WGAP-8	WGAP-8/08	Item 4.2.1	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends the use of an automated information system (AIS) to report and track the locations of vessels during the seismic survey.	Sakhalin Energy	An AIS recorder has been purchased for the seismic survey monitoring and mitigation.	4-D seismic survey	Closed - implemented/resolved satisfactorily		
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 9.2		Traffic & MMO	Increased vessel traffic around Aniva Bay and the Perouse Strait will increase the risk of collision, but this increased risk was not addressed in CEA.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGAP. [14 April 2010: This has not been raised since the Vancouver 1 meeting]		Closed - moot		
A. ISRP	ISRP-15	ISRP Report, p. 42 (p. 39 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	Beginning in March 2005, vessel traffic in Aniva Bay will increase as vessels begin delivering supplies and equipment to Korsakov for construction of the oil and LNG terminal at Prigorodnoye. The collision risk to gray whales posed by this new traffic was not addressed with any degree of rigour in the documents received from Sakhalin Energy.		Collision risk for WGW in Aniva Bay is not considered a real issue as they do not occur there. The issue is with increased ship traffic in La Perouse Strait during WGW spring and autumn migration.	Mar-05	Closed - no longer relevant but had not been implemented satisfactorily at the time it became moot		

WGAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 9.3		Traffic & MMO	Not all proposed mitigation measures appear to be thought through or to make practical sense. Others have been adopted without any assessment of their likely effectiveness. It remains unclear which measures are actually intended to be implemented and which measures have been listed only for form's sake. For each mitigation measure in the MMAP: (i) efforts should be made to determine what is actually meant by the proposed measure and whether it does, in fact, make sense; and (ii) Sakhalin Energy must indicate whether the measure has been implemented or whether it seriously intends to implement the measure in the future. As an example of the above problems, the proposed zoning and speed limits in the MMAP states that vessels may only enter the Piltun feeding ground in emergency situations, but that if they do, the speed limit will be 7 knots by day or 5 knots by night. This seems nonsensical in that under emergency conditions, a vessel may not be able to limit its speed to 7 or 5 knots. Therefore, it raises the concern as to whether vessels might be allowed to enter the feeding grounds under other conditions that are not clear emergencies.	Sakhalin Energy	Vessels are under mandatory reporting of any excursions outside of approved transit areas (8). Sakhalin Energy will review all such incidents and assess the causes behind them. Sakhalin Energy has clearly directed vessels that entry into the feeding area must be with pre-approval and only in emergency situations. Vessels are mandated to follow speed limits unless doing so presents an unacceptable hazard to human life (8). All mitigation measures have been assessed with respect to practical implementation and with a detailed review of what limited information is available on serious whale-vessel collisions (such as vessel speed and size). All marine mammal mitigation measures are outlined in the Marine Mammal Protection Plan (8). Vessel locations are tracked in real time using the Vessel Tracking System and unauthorized incursions in prohibited areas will be documented and addressed (32). (REFS: 8, 29b, 32). All incidents are assessed and modifications made to the mitigations as necessary. Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGAP.		Closed - no longer relevant but had not been implemented satisfactorily at the time it became moot		
D. WGAP-1	WGAP 1/023 (c)	WGAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	Concerning the issue of reducing collision risks associated with crew change vessels, the Panel notes some positive changes in the Sakhalin Energy approach. However, it believes that further work in this area is important and should be pursued. Therefore, it is recommend that: (c) Serious consideration continue to be given by Sakhalin Energy to the issue of collision risk associated with number and frequency of crew change vessel trips; a solution to this problem must be found.	Sakhalin Energy	Helicopters will be primary crew change vehicle and will be used whenever the weather permits.		Closed - no longer relevant but had not been implemented satisfactorily at the time it became moot		

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
E. Vladivostok	WGWAP/Vlad-04	WGWAP 1/007	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that information on day-by-day construction activities and locations for each vessel be provided as a document for the St. Petersburg WGWAP meeting (per the Sakhalin Energy response to WGWAP 1/007). There should be at least three sources of such information – satellite-linked tracking data for each vessel, vessel logbooks, and MMO data (recorded at half-hourly intervals).	Sakhalin Energy		15.04.07	Closed - no longer relevant but had not been implemented satisfactorily at the time it became moot		
A. ISRP	ISRP-17	ISRP Report, p. 44 (p. 41 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	Observer programmes such as those proposed by Sakhalin Energy to prevent collisions with western gray whales have another important limitation, unless those observers are truly independent. Any observer working for a company that stands to lose large amounts of work time (and money) when whales are sighted is subject to a clear conflict of interest. Assuming that an observer in such circumstances will be able to maintain appropriate vigilance and judgement is more an act of faith than reason. Whether true or not, the observer may anticipate that full and accurate reporting would place his/her livelihood at risk. Thus, observer programmes require independent oversight or verification of compliance to ensure their effectiveness.		Sakhalin Energy has been using MMOs successfully since 2003. During the seismic survey in 2003 eight shutdowns and 10 occurrences of preventative measures were implemented when there was reason to suspect that whales may be present. Sakhalin Energy has confidence in the integrity of the marine mammal scientist they use for the program.	May-05	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	Lenders Report Issues Table 10.1	
A. ISRP	ISRP-40	ISRP Report, p. 98 (p. 93 in the printed version of the report)	Traffic & MMO	The Panel's review identified the following general areas of future research: Recording and monitoring of whale/ship encounters (including strikes, near misses and safe avoidance) to determine if adjustments are needed to vessel traffic based on ship size, location, speed, daylight or other pertinent variables.		Is being done under the MMO program. Special forms exist to report such incidents.	May-05	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-1/026, WGWAP-3/003	

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
C. IISG	Item 32, p.14 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Continuing effort of Sakhalin Energy to minimize crew change vessel trips, e.g. by arranging for flexibility in shift management so that crew changes by helicopter can be postponed rather than cancelled in favour of boat usage.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy is aware of the high risk of collision for this specific vessel activity. ACTION: Investigate alternatives in order to minimize the number of crew changes using vessel traffic.	Ongoing	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-1/023	
C. IISG	Item 33, p.15 (of IISG report)		Traffic & MMO	Steps to assess the efficacy and to improve the marine mammal observer program where necessary could include: 1) A review of the MMO training program to ensure observers receive all needed information in a realistic time frame	Sakhalin Energy	Most marine mammal observers involved in the MMO program are professional biologists that have already gained quite extensive experience as MMOs from Sakhalin Energy operations. Sakhalin Energy provides its MMOs with all Sakhalin Energy protection plans and procedures during a two-day training and they receive a briefing together with the Sakhalin Energy vessel representative prior to mobilisation.		Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-1/024	
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 10.1		Traffic & MMO	Independent monitoring and oversight is required. Monitors or observers are subject to conflicts of interest and a range of pressures that may compromise their independence and objectivity. In their written responses to documents for the Gland workshop, experts identified the need for greater information/ discussion on the MMO programme (e.g. objectives, methods, effectiveness, independent oversight), and emphasized the need to use suitably experienced MMOs. The need to avoid these problems may be addressed by the advisory body (see below).	Sakhalin Energy	Terms of Reference for an advisory body and associated practical monitoring advice are being developed. Marine Mammal Observers are on separate contracts to vessels to ensure that there is no conflict of interest (28, 30). Sakhalin Energy commissioned an independent review/audit of the Marine Mammal Observers programme (July 2005) and has responded to the recommendations issued by that audit (28, 30). Some changes recommended by the audit are being implemented this year (see current Marine Mammal Protection Plan), while the remainder will be implemented for the 2006 season. (REFS: 28, 29b, 30). Audit recommendations on the Marine Mammal Observers programme are being implemented. Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGWAP.		Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	IISG Items 33-35, WGWAP-1/024-026	

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
B. Lenders	Vancouver I workshop report, issues table 10.3		Traffic & MMO	Due to the potential for collisions, there is a need for recording and monitoring of whale/ship encounters (including strikes, near misses, and safe avoidance) to determine if adjustments are needed to vessel traffic based on ship size, location, speed, daylight, or other pertinent variables. (Subsumed to 10.1) There is a need for real-time surveillance to keep track of the distribution of gray whales and to make this information available to vessels traversing the area. Sakhalin Energy will make communication of realtime observations to vessel traffic explicit in MMPP (Closed) In addition, surveys are needed at regular intervals during the open-water season along the eastern Sakhalin coast to detect stranded gray whales (or floating carcasses), coupled with a serious effort to investigate cause of death whenever a dead gray whale is found.	Sakhalin Energy	The Vessel Tracking System (27, 32) used by Sakhalin Energy provides real time vessel location data. The reporting of all incidents of whale-vessel encounters is mandatory (8). Marine Mammal Observers on vessels report sightings daily and communicate with other vessels if needed (8, 30). Marine Mammal Observers report all instances of mitigation measures begin used and this information is reviewed and the mitigation measures are adapted if needed (30). All floating or stranded gray whales in the Sakhalin Energy project area are reported and Sakhalin Energy will cooperate with the relevant Russian agencies to respond if requested (8, 30). (REFS: 8, 27, 30, 32). Sakhalin Energy accepts that this issue will go to the WGWAP.		Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	In part by IISG Item 37 and in part by WGWAP 1/010, 2/004.	
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/023 (a)	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	Concerning the issue of reducing collision risks associated with crew change vessels, the Panel notes some positive changes in the Sakhalin Energy approach. However, it believes that further work in this area is important and should be pursued. Therefore, it is recommend that: (a) Both crew change vessels have 2 MMOs onboard on a permanent basis, as recommended by the IISG, instead of 'whenever possible', as reported by Sakhalin Energy at this meeting;	Sakhalin Energy	This was Implemented in 2006 and is planned for 2007	Nov-07	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-3/006	
D. WGWAP-1	WGWAP 1/025 (a)	WGWAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	As a way of helping to assess the risk of ship-whale collisions during poor visibility conditions, it is recommended that, at a minimum, the following information be provided to the next meeting of the WGWAP: (a) Amount of MMO effort under conditions with visibility ≤ 1 km;	Sakhalin Energy	These will be incorporated into MMO close-out report 2006. This will be made available to the WGWAP early in 2007.	Apr-07	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-3/002, WGWAP-3/003	

GWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
D. WGAP-1	WGAP 1/025 (b)	WGAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	As a way of helping to assess the risk of ship-whale collisions during poor visibility conditions, it is recommended that, at a minimum, the following information be provided to the next meeting of the WGAP: (b) Number of crew change vessel trips conducted in conditions with visibility ≤ 1 km or at night;	Sakhalin Energy	These will be incorporated into MMO close-out report 2006. This will be made available to the WGAP early in 2007.	Apr-07	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGAP-3/002, WGAP-3/003	
D. WGAP-1	WGAP 1/025 (c)	WGAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	As a way of helping to assess the risk of ship-whale collisions during poor visibility conditions, it is recommended that, at a minimum, the following information be provided to the next meeting of the WGAP: (c) Number of whales detected during poor weather conditions (e.g. visibility ≤ 1 km, Beaufort sea state ≥ 3 , or after sunset);	Sakhalin Energy	These will be incorporated into MMO close-out report 2006. This will be made available to the WGAP early in 2007.	Apr-07	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGAP-3/002, WGAP-3/003	
D. WGAP-1	WGAP 1/025 (d)	WGAP 1/3 - Section 12.1	Traffic & MMO	As a way of helping to assess the risk of ship-whale collisions during poor visibility conditions, it is recommended that, at a minimum, the following information be provided to the next meeting of the WGAP: (d) Number of whales detected during good weather and good visibility conditions.	Sakhalin Energy	These will be incorporated into MMO close-out report 2006. This will be made available to the WGAP early in 2007.	Apr-07	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGAP-3/002, WGAP-3/003	
D. WGAP-1	WGAP 1/026	WGAP 1/3 - Section 12.2	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recognises the effort invested by the company towards improving MMO effectiveness. Nevertheless, a meaningful evaluation of the MMO programme will be feasible only after a detailed report has been made available to the Panel on MMO observations and measures taken in response to them in the 2006 season. The Panel recommends that such a report be submitted for consideration at the next WGAP meeting and emphasises that the report must be more than a collation of observer data and should include appropriate analyses.	Sakhalin Energy	The report will be presented to the panel by next meeting.		Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGAP-3/002, WGAP-3/005	

WGWAP Recommendations Table - Traffic and MMO

Meeting	Reference	Cross-Reference	Topic	Recommendation	Party resp.	Response	Target completion date	Status	Superseded by	Comments
F. WGWAP-2	WGWAP 2/007	WGWAP 2/3 Section 6.2	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that MMOs are also placed on the crew change vessel operating between Nogliki and LUN-A at all times.	Sakhalin Energy	The most extensive Sakhalin Energy activities in Lunskeye were carried out in 2005-2006. The level of activities in 2007 is going to be much lower than in the previous years. Based on the Collision Risk Assessment the probability to encounter the whale in this area is very low. This was confirmed in 2005 when no sightings were recorded from 11 vessels in the area and in 2006 when 1 whale was sighted in 2000 hours of observations. Therefore, we consider not placing the MMO on these trips, and propose to give the MMO briefing to the crew of the boats.		Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-3/006	
G. WGWAP-3	WGWAP 3/001	WGWAP 3/3 Section 3.1	Traffic & MMO	The Panel recommends that as a minimum, Sakhalin Energy request general permission from the Russian Ministry of Natural Resources to collect small tissue samples from dead WGWs for genetic analyses.	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy will approach the Authorities.	Apr-08	Closed - superseded by a new recommendation	WGWAP-4/004	
J. WGWAP-6	WGWAP-6/021	Item 8.1	Traffic & MMO	The Panel requests that Sakhalin Energy prepare an analysis for WGWAP-7 that compares MMO observations across years, with emphasis on the crew change vessels	Sakhalin Energy	Sakhalin Energy will present this at WGWAP-7.	December 2009	Open - no action yet taken		